

Online Research @ Cardiff

This is an Open Access document downloaded from ORCA, Cardiff University's institutional repository: <https://orca.cardiff.ac.uk/id/eprint/88394/>

This is the author's version of a work that was submitted to / accepted for publication.

Citation for final published version:

Renold, Emma ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6472-0224> and Ivinson, Gabrielle 2014. Horse-girl assemblages: towards a post-human cartography of girls' desire in an ex-mining valleys community. Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education 35 (3) , pp. 361-376.
10.1080/01596306.2014.888841 file

Publishers page: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2014.888841>
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2014.888841>>

Please note:

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite this paper.

This version is being made available in accordance with publisher policies.

See

<http://orca.cf.ac.uk/policies.html> for usage policies. Copyright and moral rights for publications made available in ORCA are retained by the copyright holders.



HORSE-GIRL ASSEMBLAGES: TOWARDS A POSTHUMAN CARTOGRAPHY OF GIRLS' DESIRES IN AN EX-MINING VALLEYS COMMUNITY

AUTHORS

Professor Emma Renold (School of Social Sciences, Cardiff University, renold@cf.ac.uk)

Professor Gabrielle Ivinson (School of Education, University of Aberdeen, gabrielle.ivinson@abdn.ac.uk)

ABSTRACT The paper works with queer and feminist posthuman materialist scholarship to understand the way young teen valleys' girls experienced ubiquitous feelings of fear, risk, vulnerability and violence. Longitudinal ethnographic research of girls (aged 12-15) living in an ex-mining semi-rural community suggests how girls are negotiating complex gendered and sexual mores of valleys' life. We draw on Deleuze and Guatarri's concept of 'becomings' emerging in social-material-historical 'assemblages' to map how the gendered and queer legacies of the community's equine past surfaces affectively in girls' talk about horses. Our cartography traces a range of 'transversal flashes' in which girls' lives and their activities with horses resonate with a local history coloured by the harsh conditions of mining as well as liberatory moments of 'pure desire'. We creatively explore Deleuze and Guatarri's provocation to return desire to its polymorphous revolutionary force. Instead of viewing girls as needing to be empowered, transformed or rerouted, we emphasize the potential of what girls already do and feel and the more-than-human assemblages which enable these desires.

Introduction: pit-lasses, pit-ponies and poverty

"The harness, the belt, the chains and the pushing are the heritage of females in British mines" (Rev. T. Eddy, 1854: 297)

"I canna say that I like the work well for I am obliged to do it: it is horse work" (Agnes Kerr, 15, coal bearer, cited in Bates 2012:123)

Historically, the landscape of south Wales is renowned for its abundance of coal and iron ore in its valleys. While Welsh coal is known to have been excavated since Roman times, Britain's industrial revolution (1730's – 1850's) saw a rapid rise in global coal export, resulting in an exponential increase in population and a violent disfigurement of the natural and agricultural landscape. Despite the grim life at the coalface, thousands were drawn away from working on the land into the precarious work of mining. While representations of mining as male labour dominate, there is a hidden history of women's involvement in mining. Children and women worked alongside men, 12-14 hours a day, underground in cramped and dangerous conditions, doing hard, back-breaking work. Getting the work done and increasing production, rather than the gender of the workers, took priority. Indeed, women's own testimonies point to the regularity of woman doing the lifting and heavy work. As Denise Bates' (2012, 1099) research into pit-lasses explains, "women would work for less pay than men required and would accept conditions that no man would tolerate".

Girls as young as six regularly descended ladders into the pits to draw up tubs of coal (aka 'basket girls'), and many were routinely harnessed to wagons to haul heavy loads some distance, sometimes several hundred yards as Agnes testifies above. The quote introducing this section powerfully describes the way harnessed pit-girls were a significant part of the "heritage of British mines" – a heritage that portrays subjugation and strength, and as the following excerpts suggest, an image of female masculinity (Halberstam 1998) that was decried as unnatural and immoral by the male middle-class commissioners of the time:

One of the most disgusting sites I have ever seen, was that young females, dressed like boys in trowsers (sic), crawling on all fours, with belts and chains (Testimony of Thomas Pearce, 1854).

Witnesses agree in testifying as to the demoralizing effects of subterranean labor upon the female sex. When the shrinking delicacy of woman is gone she is unsexed. She becomes the actor of masculine vices, with seldom the virtues of

the other sex ... The discipline of the mines crushes it – implants in its place a stolid indifference or wayward recklessness [Rev. Eddy, 1854: 297]

When boys were following girls with torn breeches they could see them all between the legs naked. This was perhaps the most horrific evidence Symond (commissioner) heard. He could only add that any sight more disgustingly indecent or revolting could scarcely be imagined than these girls at work. No brothel could beat it (Bates 2012:1217).

These examples gesture towards a queer rupture of the gender order of the day, provoking an abject disgust at girls-becoming-boys, women-becoming-men, if not in-hu-man (“unsexed”) together with the sexualizing of girls’ sartorial and working bodies. The ‘disciplinary’ forces of pit-life, ‘crushing’ ‘female purity’ and unleashing ‘masculine vices’ and ‘wayward’ ‘recklessness’ and sexual impropriety and promiscuity of ‘half-dressed’ and ‘naked girls’, were decontextualized, sensationalized and eroticized via sketches and photographs in the Victorian printing press (Bates 2012). Indeed claims regarding the moral degeneration of girls and women as they laboured in mining environments were used as the rationale for preventing women and children under 10 from working underground. After a number of attempts, the 1842 miners Act effectively shunted women (and their families), who often only knew colliery life, into further poverty. Many women tried to oppose the Act, while others creatively dressed in ‘men’s clothes’ in order to pass as male and “gain a few days wages for the sake of bare subsistence” (Brown 1851). Even so, after the 1842 Act the hetero-patriarchal bonds gradually tightened and coal mining became exclusively ‘men’s work’. In sum, pit-lasses were replaced by pit-ponies (the colliery horse) and women were called upon to re-learn a domesticated, respectable and less ‘wild’ femininity. Indeed schools were discussed as sites for the sole purpose of educating girls so that they:

would be raised from their present degraded situation ... (to) become useful members of society, their morals would be preserved in a pure state,

their personal appearance would be improved ... they would become virtuous endearing wives ... the improved condition of the females would react on the males ... wean the men from bad habits of every kind (Robert Brown, 1851).

Fast forward 100 years and the gendered division of labour became imbued with new tensions as traditional mining jobs disappeared and men were increasingly unemployed in mining areas. From the 1930's to the 1980s mechanisation allowed coal to be extracted in huge quantities yet for increasingly higher prices and the UK was unable to compete with cheaper coal extraction in China. Since the deliberate mass closure of the mines initiated by Thatcher's Government in the 1980's, men's bodies were no longer needed to stoically endure hard manual labour and many became long-term unemployed. Today, the only available jobs are in the service sectors which is widely recognised in these ex-mining locales as 'feminine work' (Walkerdine and Jiminez 2012). Girls anticipate, and mothers and grandmothers dominate, the caring and service sectors. As for the colliery horses, they are used for agricultural work or have gradually returned to the wilderness. The last working pit pony died in 1999.

In our longitudinal ethnographic project, 'Young People and Place' we worked with young people in a locale known for its mining heritage at a time when all the mines had finally closed down. For the young teens in our research a complex set of values and associations surfaced. High levels of multiple deprivation continue to be a signature of the valleys which attract European 'Communities First' funding along with multiple, often unsuccessful, attempts at regeneration. In contemporary times, anxieties surrounding enforced conditions of human worklessness are infused with strong traditions around heteronormative gender roles rooted in the industrial past. Girls' talk was infused with tensions that seemed to bear the signs of industrial legacies of what girls and women were expected to do and be. This was most noticeable in their talk of sexual safety and danger and how they negotiated the affordances of the valleys landscape.

Many girls in the study said they felt unsafe yet to varying degrees. They spoke of the difficulties often associated with poverty, such as physical and heterosexual violence, illness, accidents and loss (Ivinson and Renold 2013a, Renold 2013). Moreover, in these newly gendered places, girls were growing up with complex contradictory messages. Postfeminist school-based slogans plastering classroom walls called on girls to aim high, work hard, never give up and be empowered (Ringrose 2007). In contrast, community messages steeped in a history where generations of strong women have kept families afloat, demand girls stay close and couple up with boyfriends as ways to keep boys safe. In effect these practices help to keep traditional masculinity intact (Walkerdine and Jimenez 2012). The specific legacies of pre-industrialisation, industrialisation and post-industrialisation mesh together with the gendered history of the place that shape girls' everyday practices and imagined ways forward.

This paper develops our previous work which draws on some of the conceptual moves in queer and feminist posthuman materialist scholarship to understand the way young teen valleys' girls alluded to the aliveness of their bodies in ways that ruptured (hetero)normative femininity. We theorise these practices as, 'becomings' emerging in social-material-historical 'assemblages' by drawing on Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari's oeuvre. Previously, we have written about how girls' becomings emerged in entanglements with bikes, skate-boards and other objects in various terrains and landscapes beyond the school walls (Ivinson and Renold 2013a, 2013b). The focus of this paper is on girls-with-horses and works with Deleuze-Guattarian notions of desire in dynamic affective post-human assemblages. The local-historical affects that we detected in our fieldwork required us to widen our focus beyond educational institutions and to recognize how becomings emerge through on-going practices that are entangled with place, history and landscape.

Posthuman assemblages and locating 'becomings' in history and place.

Feminist and queer scholarship on neo-materialism is encouraging social scientists to think with new ontologies of the decentered subject: this is a posthuman version of a non-unitary, impersonal and post-identitarian subject

that foregrounds the more-than-human (Braidotti 2005, 2006, 2013; Grosz 2011; Alaimio and Hekman 2006; Barad 2007; Probyn 1996). Emphasising non-dualistic understandings of nature-culture interactions, this scholarship pushes us to think critically and creatively about post anthropocentric relations and the intra-action (Barad 2007) of more than human worlds (e.g. animal worlds, environmental worlds, material worlds etc.).

Entanglements of intra-acting phenomena are always located in time, history and place. So, when we consider the everyday practices that girls are part of and undertake in the valleys, we come to see these as practices that carry affective traces of the past that leap between any number of what Deleuze and Guattari call, 'existential territories'; that is, those 'transversal flashes' (Guattari 1995:93) of affective space, created by experience in assemblages. If we focus on the pit-pony-girl assemblage such as the one alluded to in the opening section, we can recognize the specifically emplaced (i.e. south valleys coalfields) and historical (patriarchal and capitalist) bonds between girls/women, the coalface and the colliery horse. Thus 'assemblages' can be made up of all manner of matter: corporeal, technological, mechanical, virtual, discursive and imaginary that carry affective charges. Agency or what we would theorise as 'becomings' (Ivinson and Renold 2013a) emerge in the intra-action of elements in assemblages. Recognizing how traces of place and history become revitalized within acting assemblages can provide some powerful insights into resources and barriers that girls encounter in their everyday lives and how they imagine themselves forward through dreams and aspirations. Thus a multiplicity of possible 'becomings' might be enfolded in one girl's action. Alternatively, because assemblages incessantly form and reform as part of the dynamic movement of life, some material or contextual elements and not others may become salient at specific moments. In sum, being is complex, contradictory and multi-faceted and cannot be separated from places, history and corporeality (Walkerdine 2013).

Our focus on socio-material-historical assemblages demands an exploration of how living beings and matter mesh and "become more and other than their

histories through their engagement with dynamic environments” (Grosz 2011: 2). It necessitates a radical post-individual and non-anthropocentric theory of desire and a more complex understanding of how change, the unpredictable and the new are generated. In this paper we draw attention to the importance of how place affords an entanglement with ‘the wild’ (Bennett 2010) and specifically with the Welsh (mountain/pit) Pony.

Mapping becomings: working diffractively and affectively with data assemblages

The Young People and Place projectⁱ was methodologically funded research, designed specifically to experiment with different ways of creating research encounters that could capture the more multi-sensory and affective relations of space and place (see Hughes and Lury 2013). The research, which began in 2009 (and continues un-funded) has become a multi-phased ethnography, organically evolving as opportunities and new connections and possibilities arise. The first phase involved over 60 semi-structured interviews using photographs of places in and around the locale with young people aged 13-15 in two local secondary schools. In parallel to this school-based research we worked ethnographically in a local Youth Centre that we visited every Monday evening for one year. In the second phase we invited young people to take pictures of places in and around the school and these were used as the basis for further ethnographic interviews, including mobile methods, such as walking tours (see Ivinson and Renold 2013b, Ross et al. 2012). In the third phase we focused on film-making. Six groups of young people worked with a film-maker while performing and talking about out-of-school activities (see Renold and Ivinson 2013). A fourth (un-funded) phase focused on corporeality as we invited girls aged 12-17 years to work with a choreographer as part of a school-based activity week. Our approach might best be described as rhizomatic, whereby we follow analytic trails from previous research encounters, and find ways (and funds) to create research assemblages that enable us not only to sustain our research relationships but capture the thick and affective materiality of young people living in and around a valley town we call Cwm Dyffryn (a fictional name).

The range of creative arts-based ethnographic methods, especially the film making, walking tours and body-movement workshops has, over time, allowed us to explore affects associated with the micro-intensities of everyday life (Coleman and Ringrose 2012; Lury and Wakeford 2012; Walkerdine 2010, Hollway 2010; Hickey-Moody 2013). We have written elsewhere how these methods enable us to explore the multi-sensory dimensions of place, including our 'gut reactions' when young people chose to show us specific artefacts, or told us vivid stories that touched us affectively (Ivinson and Renold 2013b).

In this paper we draw on Karen Barad's (2007) diffractive methodology (see also, Taylor and Ivinson 2013) to explore how talk in seated interviews intra-act with historical archive data and feminist materialist theory in order to trace how the gendered and queer legacies of the valley's equine past surfaces affectively in girls' horse-talk. Working this way allow us to map the affective 'ontological intensities' (Deleuze and Guatarri 1987) of those often imperceptible micro-moments of teen girls' becomings (see also Coleman 2008; Renold and Ringrose 2011; Ringrose 2013; Gonick and Gannon 2013; Juelskjaer 2013). In sum, we try to locate moments when more expansive becomings come into view, and connect to desires that, even if not fully realized, "throw us forward into other relations of becoming and belonging" (Probyn 1996:59). These are the potentialities for becoming other (Grosz 2011, Braidotti 2011), that, if supported, may help young people to move beyond the constraints of the place/history/ gendered expectations of where they are growing up.

Horse assemblages and ontological intensities

The landscape of south Wales has many villages backing onto open mountainous scapes that afford the possibility for a rich and physical engagement with the wild. While many young teen boys talked animatedly about the adventures they had and continued to have with the wild and their local outdoors, girls were generally more hesitant and much less animated in interviews. Many girls talked about how they had given up the physical activities they used to do, such as den-building, biking, hiking and climbing. Some girls made direct links with how their everyday practices of 'girlling' (e.g. hair, make-up, not 'getting dirty' or 'sweaty')

compromised and disrupted continuing with these outdoor pursuits. Their narratives betrayed the many different ways they felt their adolescent bodies to be under surveillance. They displayed a ubiquitous fear of “constantly being watched”, needing to “know where you could run to”, where you “could hide” and how “to avoid” places and people who might “take you”, “attack you”, “kidnap you” and “rape you”. Other girls disclosed specific details of being followed and of physical heterosexual violence (see Kayleigh’s story in Iverson and Renold 2013a). While many of these experiences often went no further than their peer group, those that did disclose to the police or education welfare officers were either not taken seriously, or experienced interventions that did nothing to change the situation.

Collectively, the girls’ accounts intimated that like the pit-ponies and pit-lasses, they seemed to experience their bodies as not being entirely their own (Young 1990). In this paper we go a step further and focus specifically on affective existential territories that we became aware of as girls spoke about horses and horse-riding and which moved us to explore girls’ entanglements with histories of horses in the valleys. When we researched the history of pit-ponies in industrial and post-industrial Wales we were struck by contradictory representations. While horses were aligned with freedom and the Welsh Mountain Pony in particular with hardiness as well as exploitation and servitude other tales also survive. For example, before the Romans, the Welsh Mountain Pony out-witted many masters (Welsh Pony and Cob Society, www.wpcs.uk). Henry VIII established an edict that all horses under 15 hands be destroyed because they were able to hide in places where humans were unable or unwilling to go (ibid). The Welsh pony seemed to be represented through an interesting combination of beauty, temperament, toughness and endurance.

We found that girls’ interview accounts of horses and horse riding resonated with the motifs of survival and strength associated with the Welsh Mountain Pony and of subordination and exploitation associated with the Pit-Pony and Pit-Lasses. It is these ‘transversal flashes’ across historical/contemporary existential territories that we explore creatively below.

Taking the reigns, to 'keep on moving'

Sensationalist media stories of horse neglect and abuse emerge from time to time across the Anglophone world and Wales is no exception. Rarely, however, do media headlines connect human and animal cruelty (hum/animal) to the exploitation and poverty of living in economically deprived communities. Rarely do we learn about how the abuse of individual horses intra-acts with the historical and trans-generational neglect of pre-industrial and postindustrial communities - communities made up of land, animals and people (see Quinn 2013). In postindustrial Wales horses are almost entirely kept for recreational purposes in owned or rented stable complexes, or they are bred from old blood lines and shown at regional events and performance competitions (see www.wpcs.uk). In Cwm Dyffryn, as in other semi-rural locations across Wales, horses roam wild across mountain and open land that can be viewed from most roads, and indeed was the view from the stairwell in one of the local secondary schools. While there were boys in our project who did ride horses (usually bare-back and in the wild, on mountain trails) and boys who wanted to be jockeys and race competitively (Ward 2013; Renold 2013), they were by far in the minority and their activities were often kept private from wider peer culture (Ivinson, 2012). Very few boys discussed horses as one of their recreational activities. Caring for horses and horse-riding was predominantly viewed as girls' pursuits.

The four girls in the project who talked most about their relationship with horses, were Gati, Jen, Awen and Nia (all pseudonyms). Unlike representations and fantasies depicted in white middle-class pony-book genres (see Haymonds 2000), valleys' girls did not usually own an individual horse (see also Ojanen 2012). As Awen put it, "we own bits of him". The communal sharing of horses and the everyday practices of sheltering, grooming, feeding and riding was distributed across a matriarchal line of girls and women. Girls talked about sharing horses with their friends, with their mothers and their mother's friends. Boys and men tended not to figure in these accounts. Girls talked about rescuing horses from older male farmers who could no longer look after or ride them. Jen

talked of sharing a horse, but swiftly moved on to tell us of how she will soon be riding her neighbour's horses:

Jen: I'm going to start riding the man next door's horses. He got, I think he got twelve, and he can't do it cos he's had a new hip replacement so he wants us to start riding

GI: so he's got twelve horses?

Jen: Yeah

GI: That's quite a lot to look after: are they in a field or stables or?

Jen: Field and stables. But he said you gotta start riding now cos they're getting so fat with all the grass and hay

Jen's desire to start riding her neighbour's horses could be interpreted through dominant gendered expectations of girls and women as nurturers and carers, both of animals and of men. However, the girls' contradictory comments of how they "love looking after horses" and how "when we are not riding, we'll be up there and build jumps and logs and all that", but hate "grooming" or "mucking out" complicate this analysis. We speculate that riding itself, rather than what it represents or symbolizes, connects to their desires to "be outside" in "all weathers", and not "stuck inside". Cati, for example, talks about how she dislikes being penned in and forced to undertake domestic drudgery like her "poor mother" who "stays in on Saturdays to wash up and clean the house".

Indeed, girls talked animatedly about riding horses. Some talked about how they "ride everyday" and how they enjoyed taking off in small groups to "ride up the mountains". It is possible to consider this double entanglement of riding-girl/ridden-horse where girls needed to be 'out' and horses needed to be 'ridden' as an assemblage which rescues both pony and girl from a sedentary existence of being penned into a domestic/stable cage. We get a glimpse of this 'transversal flash' of a more life affirming riding assemblage in the extract below where Jen talks about "obeying" and questioning rules and regulations. She talks about possessing a thwarted, yet independent spirit, and "having a mind of her own" just like her horse, Henry:

Jen: Horses have got a mind of their own so when they like don't listen you gotta make them do it. They're very stubborn. You want to them stop, you like pull the reigns ... they keep on going, they like to have their own mind. They're like us really, they like to do what they want, but we gotta obey orders we have, haven't we?

The mixture of will power ("stubborn"), force ("make them do it"), onward movement ("keep on going"), discipline ("obey orders") and autonomy ("own mind") entangle in ways that perhaps create an affective space that enabled girls to 'keep on going'. Indeed, this horse-girl assemblage didn't seem to be about pure *jouissance* or *délire*, but an assemblage that enabled girls to survive the fear of living in communities where they felt acutely 'reigned in'.

While girls such as Cati and Jen loved being outdoors, violence and the fear of violence were part of the perceived social fabric of being 'outside'. For example, in Cati's response to the photographs of different places and spaces, she chose images that represented the fundamental need for humans to survive and grow: food, shelter and education. She talked a lot about the fear of 'being on her own' (as the majority of girls did) and the importance of female togetherness to ensure safety. Her interview was punctured with numerous descriptions of her body seemingly under attack. She talked about the possibility of being hit by a train, of being run over and killed by a car, and of being physically assaulted by "drunk men" who "don't know what they're doing". Her anxiety that "something might happen" was a ubiquitous fear that seemed to be associated with the local context: "It's not safe, but it's not safe anywhere really is it?" However, this sense of vulnerability was thrown into relief when Cati told us that she walks on her own to see her horse suggesting that she also experienced autonomy and strength.

As outlined earlier in the paper, all of the girls spoke at length about the perceived everyday physical and heterosexual violence and some disclosed that they had witnessed or experienced both in the street and/or at home. They gave

us the impression that to enjoy the outdoors, being on horseback was almost a necessity. Just like the Welsh mountain ponies that had transported goods across the mountains before industrialisation, girls spoke clearly about “know(ing) where to go and where not to go”. They seemed to follow the grooves of well-trodden paths and trusted their horses to “take them anywhere”. Awen talked about how close she was to her horse. Then we asked “what more would you want”? She replied. “I know. No, like nasty people. Rapists and all that”. It seemed that horses were directly associated with sexual protection and sexual safety:

Awen: I feel like a bit safe because if anybody does try, like attack us or sometimes, you know just ride off and like I’ve got a group of us so nobody like try and attack us.

Being with her horse and physically high up on horse back, seemed to enable Awen to imagine that she could “ride off” and escape any potential attacks from hu/man others.

Perhaps, unsurprisingly, horses also featured strongly in girls’ imagined futures. Three of the four girls stated emphatically that they wanted to work with animals and specifically horses. They expressed a passion for opening their own stables or horse-farm, images that perhaps connect directly to the idea of a queer (non-heteronormative) post-human future in which they could ‘keep on moving’.

The connection between corporeality and movement resonated powerfully in Nia’s account. At the end of her interview she revealed that her mother’s side of the family suffers from a muscular hereditary disease preventing mobility and movement. Nia’ ambition was to set up a horse riding stable for children while working part-time as a health visitor. In contrast, Cati talked about wanting ‘a horse farm with loads of horses’. She detailed the strategy she would employ to realize this dream: “I’m gonna be clever in school, then I’ll get the job I want, to get the money I’ll need” to buy “my own farm”. Her fantasy involved moving from the risks and dangers of rural-urban Cwm Dyffryn and further into the wildness of an outlying village, “because I don’t really want my child growing up around

this place". Awen's ambition to become a mounted police officer involved a fantasy of being able to keep the whole community safe. This horse-police-girl assemblage suggests a sense of protection and freedom. She described how she feels "safe" when the police on their mounted horses are around.

In this section, rescue, repair and nurture mingle in becomings of survival. We see elements of exploitation and inventiveness that we can trace rhizomatically through the history of the place. Girls, horses, being outside and other elements created a cluster of capabilities that perhaps enabled participants to express a sense of how they could 'keep on moving' and survive harsh times and violent pasts and presents. We can see this as a pit-girl-pony assemblage that captures affects that relate to a legacy of servitude while a wild-girl-mountain-pony assemblage captures affects relating to survival, inventiveness and protectiveness.

We detected a desire to 'keep on moving' as a strong affective force in each girl's account. The next section explores intense moments that we suggest signal what Deleuze and Guattari refer to as 'lines of flight' (Deleuze & Guattari, 1994, p. 338).

YAR!: riding lines of flight

I used to be petrified ... and look at me now ... riding and EVERYTHING! (Nia, age 13)

Scattered throughout girls' accounts of horses and riding were gestures, sighs, throwaway comments and expressions that hinted at feelings of liberation. However, extended and coherent stories of liberation were generally absent. Rather we detected what Maggie MacLure calls data 'hot spots' (MacClure 2012) or as we have been theorizing here, those affective incorporeal 'transversal flashes' that lingered - existential refrains that we wanted to return to again and again. We have tried to trace these affective resonances across the narratives to

make visible the often imperceptible moments of what Deleuze and Guattari refer to as drops of 'pure desire'.

There were many such moments in Nia's narrative. Like many girls in the study, an aversion to rubbish on the street animated her talk about the local landscape. The focus on cleanliness seemed to act as an antidote to the widespread neglect and decay of the buildings in many valleys' towns. Many shop windows are boarded up and grand old buildings have fallen into disrepair and become derelict. In her narrative, talk of decay interweaves with talk of newborn babies and bodily rejuvenation. For example, Nia described her dad's trip to the gym everyday to become a competitive body builder and her baby-sitting practices. We focus on the following interview extract because the more literal talk of new life seems to capture Deleuze and Guattari's sense of desire as life force.

Nia had been riding horses and ponies since she was three years old. She related a story about her love of swings and recalled laying on the floor under a moving swing. The account carried a sense of excitement and fear: "scary it is!" she cried. Just after this exclamation, she introduced Ginger, a Welsh mountain pony, with "a matted tail". Her mother's friend had given them the pony for free because she could no longer afford to look after it. Nia was so keen to ride that she mounted him bareback.

Nia: I just take him out and do bareback

GI: Really? Is that not hard?

Nia: It's not hard no, it's just getting out there ... then, he just goes then

Later, she talked about riding with a saddle and repeatedly falling off and getting back on:

Well once he galloped on, and I said I never want to get on that horse again, straight after, I got back on him ... well I didn't trot him, and I fell off and he went to bend down for grass and I fell off. I fell down the head and landed in a bunch of stingies, I fell off cantering and I fell off galloping ... I'm on jumping now ... I used

to be petrified of horses and look at me now, and like you know, riding and everything!

Nia provided a coherent narrative about falling off and getting back on, as if horse and girl learned to overcome their fears, negotiating to canter and then eventually galloping together. We sense how gradually girl and horse fuse together as a working unit; a kind of horse-girl ensemble. In places she interrupted the flow of the narrative with throw away yet emphatic statements such as, “he just goes then” and “riding and everything”. These interjections gave us a sense of spontaneous liberation or moments of lift-off.

These moments may appear insignificant yet they surfaced in the other girls’ talk, as what we suggest can be imagined as moments of ‘becoming-horse’. This was most notable in Jen and Awen’s interviews which, as we have described earlier, were rife with talk of immanent bodily attack, involving real and imagined physical and sexual violence. Jen, for example, told us about how her older sister witnessed “the druggies opposite ... smashing his mother’s head in” and how her sister “used to be scared to go outside the door”. Straight after this she spoke of wanting to be a police woman and a dog handler. Next she started a story (that we outlined above) about her neighbour who needed his horses to be ridden. The affective flow moved from fear to protection to rescue then turned to an account of her mother riding horses when younger:

GI: Your mother had a horse?

Jen: Yeah

GI: Does she still have it?

Jen: No.

GI: When did she have it then?

Jen: I dunno ... when I was like younger and I used to just jump on her and go wherever!

GI: Oh. That’s wonderful!

Here we can see how Gabrielle's response, 'Oh... That's wonderful!' picked up on the affective charge of Jen's joyous outburst as she, in turn, remembered a powerful sense of freedom when younger. This emergent horse-girl assemblage of 'jumping on' and 'going wherever' resonated for us, not only because of the affective flow of the narrative and stories that precede it, but because it seemed to indicate a line of flight: a moment of remembering being other.

We detected the same kind of liberatory moments in Awen's interview. She started with a narrative of feeling penned in by the institutional regulations of the school and how boring she finds the local boy-dominated skate park. Then she described how every place holds risk and danger. This sequence allowed us to understand why she related a section about how she risks walking alone to get to the horse she rides everyday, even amidst overwhelming feelings that "everywhere is dangerous".

In the next extract, we can see how Kate (researcher) attempts to re-engage Awen after her talk of 'boredom' which seemed to have flattened her energy. To do this Kate reiterated the activities that Awen had talked about enjoying earlier in the interview.

KM: Well, I suppose it's not energetic enough for you, you have to be off doing lots of interesting stuff. I can't believe you can just go up the mountain, that must be brilliant?

Awen: It is good, yeah

KM: Do you just feel really free like?

Awen: Yeah! It's funny sometimes, when the horses just take off, and just like, YAR!!

We can see how Kate prompts Awen to recall the feelings she had while riding. This leads to Awen's energetic outburst, 'just like, YAR!!' Sound is important here. Awen is very softly spoken and quite monosyllabic throughout her interview. At the moment, 'YAR' is loudly exclaimed, her sonic outburst fills the silent classroom space. Awen also intimated that the unpredictability of "riding

off” had an uncanny quality which she phrased as, ‘it’s funny sometimes’. In this account we can perhaps glimpse how girls with horses are enabled to go off-track and rupture the sedentary and domestic heteronormative femininity of their maternal forebears, captured by the joyous ‘YAR!!’. It seems to signal a ‘line of flight’ that at least temporarily recalls a feeling of being and becoming other.

Lisa Blackman et al. remind us, how the accounts we give of ourselves can only ever be partial (Blackman, et al. 2008; Butler, 2004; Henriques et al. 1984). We suspect that underlying these expressions were feelings that could be only partially articulated. Such feelings, if brought to the surface and articulated, are often absorbed into other, dominant discourses and in the interview data we generated, the dominant talk was of risk, danger and vulnerability. These barely articulated feelings of liberation were in danger of being re-territorialised by discourses of fear and so lost to the researcher and to the girls themselves. Identifying these partial articulations goes some way towards recovering affects that are often excluded in the analysis of interview talk. We glimpsed affects that resonated with the wild intensities of the mountain pony when girls’ feel the rhythms of unpredictability as they ride bare-back, go off track, and feel a sense of being high off the ground. Recovering and recognizing these as queer affects is for us a pressing ethico-political priority because it allows us to detect potentialities of ways of being otherwise.

Discussion: What (else) can a horse-girl do?

“Little Hans’ horse is not representative but affective. It is not a member of a species but an element or individual in a machinic assemblage: draft, horse-omnibus-street ... these affects circulate and are transformed within the assemblage: what a horse ‘can do’” (Deleuze and Guatarri 1987:284)

Across eras women riders have upset the ‘natural’ sex/uality/gender order. While there is a vibrant feminist and queer literature on women and horses in the arts and humanities (Weidemeyer 2006; Hilton 2013), traditional figurations of the horse as “impossibly phallic” endure - trapped in a range of

“epistemological belongings” (Probyn, 1996:45). There is very little empirical literature on girls, gender, sexuality and horses in the social, educational and psychological sciences (see Ojanen 2012). When accounts are found they tend to portray a normative structure of young female sexuality. For example, take Anna Freud’s analysis of how the horse-crazed girl pivots around autoeroticism, phallic and patriarchal lack:

A little girl’s horse-craze betrays either her primitive autoerotic desires (if her enjoyment is confined to the rhythmic movement of the horse); or her identification with the care-taking mother (if she enjoys above all looking after the horse, grooming it etc.; or her penis envy (if she identifies with the big, powerful animal and treats it as an addition to her own body); or her phallic sublimations (if it is her ambition to master the horse, to perform on it, etc.) (Cited in Weidemeyer 2006: 15).

Just as Deleuze and Guatarri free up the oedipal fixing of Freud’s interpretation of Little Hans’ relation to the horse as phallic projection and displacement, focusing instead on what a horse-boy-assemblage can do (see also Buchanan 2013), Probyn liberates the horse-girl from the grip of Freudian oedipalisation. In, “Girls and girls and girls and horses: Queer image of singularity and desire”, Probyn (1993) illustrates just how normative and enduring the teleological narrative of girls’ displaced sexual desire is. Girls’ transitions into womanhood are marked out in a series of multiple losses: from horse-crazy to best-friend crazy to boy-crazy. In sum, the girl ditches the horse, for the best friend, and then ditches the best friend when she becomes ‘girlfriend’. Probyn queers this heteronormative linear sequence in an autobiographical twist claiming how living and growing up in the mid-Wales Valleys, she never ‘got over’ horses or best friends, rather “we chose each other and our ponies over boys” (1993:24).

For the girls living and growing up in the post-industrial, ex-mining locale of Cwm Dyffryn, being on horseback complicated these teleological accounts of lack-driven, heterosexual desires. In our project, girls riding horses seemed less about connecting to images of male phallic power and more about being

physically high up and be able to “ride off” to escape any potential attacks. Some girls did talk about older girls or girls their own age who had ditched their horses when boys and boyfriends came on the scene:

Nia: My friend used to have one (horse) but she had to sell it because her sister lost interest in riding. Basically, if you have meet a boy then ... she actually had a boyfriend and everything, so she wasn't like taking no notice of the thing

However, even these tales of girls ditching horses for boyfriends need to be contextualized with the ways in which many girls (and boys) talked about being ‘in relationship’. Not far from the surface talk of ‘wanting a boyfriend’ to create and enhance a normative hetero-femininity, was talk of ‘needing a boyfriend’ to protect them from physical violence in their community (see Renold 2013). This was less about eros and erotic desire, than an affective sexuality assemblage (Fox and Alldred 2013) that afforded girls physical and psychological safety.

We tentatively suggest that this is a way to exercise the “stolen becomings of the girl-child” (Deleuze and Guatarri 1987:305), in a long line of stolen becomings from the eroticization of the pit-lasses and the gendered wages of horse-work to contemporary molar sexual territorialisations of girls’ moving bodies. As Probyn (1996:51) suggests when she tells of how her mother’s passion for riding was entangled in a dream of escaping an underground bunker with her horse, “equine associations vary, and they always implicate other social structures”. As we have seen, girls’ fantasies of working with horses and riding horses were far from the decontextualized and ahistorical. Moreover, the feelings of liberation are no straightforward romantic becoming one with a horse, or any simple displacement of hetero-sexual desire (Probyn 1996), but a fleeting moment, a queer becoming, in a dynamic social-material-historical assemblage where “pivots of unpredictability, elements whose trajectories, connections and future relations remain unpredictable’ (Grosz 1994:174).

Conclusion: re-theorising desire as becoming

Recent scholarship on women and horses, particularly in relation to contemporary art, are complicating psychoanalytic tendencies to represent girls' desires for horses and horse-riding through lack. Visual artists in particular are exploring the potentialities of becoming-horse in ways that illuminate and simultaneously rupture sedimented and geographically specific gender and sexual historical legacies. Weidemeyer (2008) analyses a range of feminist artists who each take up the horse through installations that rupture the anthropomorphic, patriarchal, capitalist, militaristic and heteronormative representations of horses in art history. Natalie Jeremijenko, for example, connects movement with environmental disasters by creating a robotic horse that viewers can insert money in to 'ride' and experience the ground motion of the 1989 San Francisco earthquake (Trigger, the loma Prieta Pony, 2002).

It is from the arts and our mapping of the transversal flashes across representations of girls and women in coal mining histories, that we have become inspired to work creatively and affectively, making explicit those micro moments of deterritorialisation, when girls and horses come together in dynamic ways to create, if only temporarily, something Other. The posthuman cartography we have sketched in this paper, demands that we think again about desire and think critically about how girls (and women's) moving and working bodies are so swiftly territorialized (pathologised) through molar representations of displaced or active (hetero)sexuality.

Indeed, our wider aim has been to "put desire to work in lines of flight, lines that scramble the subjective, the sexual, the social" (Probyn 1996:62). This is a way of thinking about desire not as lack, but as productive; as a way of making connections. This isn't a desire that is oriented toward or directed by something (i.e. the Imaginary) and does not sit outside the social, in fantasy. Instead, desire is productive, it produces the real (Olkowski 2010). It still yields to and is captured by something that looks like the phallogentric oedipal complex, converting the flows, territorializing them and assigning them to molar categories of sexuality, gender, race, religion and so on (practices we see endure through the history of the eroticisation of the pit-lasses to contemporary

representations of girls-on-horses). Nevertheless, Deleuze and Guatarri direct us to the radical potential of desire, where “no matter how small, (it) is capable of calling into question the established order of a society; not that desire is asocial, on the contrary. But it is explosive” (Deleuze and Guatarri 1983:138, cited in Olkowski 2010:106). We have begun to map how, historically, girls and women working in the mines have indeed called the gender and sexual order into question – a cartography that connects with Rosi Braidotti’s (2012:149) post-queer wager of *how to radicalize sexuality and* return desire it to its polymorphous force as ‘becoming other’.

However, this is not some free flowing desire, but desire in assemblages, and assemblages that are always located in their socio-historical places, such as the coalfields of industrial Wales or the mountainous trails of postindustrial ex-mining landscapes. The ethico-political task of this paper is part of a wider endeavor to identify those moments where particular assemblages emerge to spark the possibility of something new (Hardt and Negri 2001). As Luciana Parisi writes, it is about mapping becomings “that are already here acting on a present spanning towards an immediate past-future ... agitating activities ... ready to invent a future in the everyday” (Parisi 2009:74).

This paper has taken seriously Hardt and Negri’s (2000) suggestion that we return to the potential of *aleatory materiality* as a new basis for social resistance (i.e. a materiality that is unknown, and not already coded by an inscription machine, Haraway, 1991). Recognising the potential for new forms of life is part of the radical political project proposed by Deleuze and Guattari (1984: 197) and which we hope will inform critical pedagogies that move beyond pathologising discourses of girls living in post-industrial places – discourses that emphasise educational lack (skill and aspiration), sexual excess (promiscuity and pregnancy) and parochial gender relations (regressive and myopic femininity). Instead of viewing girls as needing to be empowered, transformed or rerouted, we want to emphasize the potential of what girls already do and feel, and the affective assemblages which enable these desires. The challenge after they have

been made visible is how to harness and support girls' desires to produce genuinely new ways of being in the world.

References

- Alaimo, S. & Hekman, S. (eds.) (2008) *Material Feminisms*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Barad, K. (2007) *Meeting the Universe Halfway: quantum physics and the entanglement of matter and meaning*. Durham and London, Duke University Press.
- Bates, D. (2012) *Pit Lasses: Women and Girls in Coalmining c.1800-1914*. Yorkshire: Wharncliffe Books.
- Bennett, J. (2010) *Vibrant Matter: a political ecology of things*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- Buchanan, I. M. (2013) The Little Hans Assemblage. *Visual Arts Research*, 39 (1), 9-17.
- Braidotti, R. (2002/5) *Metamorphoses: Towards a material theory of becoming*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Braidotti, R. (2006) *Transpositions. On Nomadic Ethics*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Braidotti, R. (2013) *The Posthuman*. Polity Press: Cambridge.
- Brown (1851) testimony cited in the Mining District Report 1851, Act 5 & 6 Vict. c99, (Mines and Collieries Act 1842)
<http://scottishminning.co.uk/113.html> (accessed 25/10/13)
- Coleman, R. & Ringrose, J. (2013) Introduction: Deleuze and research methodologies. In R. Coleman & J. Ringrose. (Eds.) *Deleuze and research methodologies*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press
- Cunningham, G. (1996) *Seizing the Reins: Women, Girls and Horses*. In S. Screats and G. Cunningham (eds.) *Image & Power: Women in Fiction in the Twentieth Century*. New York: Longman.
- Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1987) *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. B. Massumi, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

- Eddy, Rev. T.M. (1854) *Women in British Mines*. In *The Ladies' Repository: a monthly periodical, devoted to literature, arts, and religion*, 14 (7) <http://freepages.genealogy.rootsweb.ancestry.com/~stenhouse/coal/pbl/Texts/wibm.html> (accessed 25/10/13)
- Fox, N. and Alldred, P. (2013) The sexuality-assemblage: desire, affect, anti-humanism, *Sociological Review*, 61 (4): 769–789
- Gonick, M. and Gannon, S. (2013) Collective Biography: An Introduction, *International Journal of Girlhood Studies*, 6 (1): pp. 7-12
- Grosz, E. (1994) *Volatile Bodies: Towards a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Grosz, E. (2011) *Becoming Undone: Darwinian Reflections on Life, Politics and Art*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Guatarri, F. (1995) *Chaosmosis: An Ethico-Aesthetic Paradigm*. [trans. Paul Baines], Power Publications, Sydney: Australia.
- Halberstam, J. (1998) *Female Masculinity*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Haymonds, A. (2000) "Rides of Passage: Female Heroes in Pony Stories," in D. Jones and T. Watkins (eds.) *A Necessary Fantasy? The Heroic Figure in Children's Popular Culture*. New York: Garland. pp. 51 – 72;
- Haraway, D. (1991) *Simians, Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature*. London: Free Association Press.
- Ivinson, G. (2012) 'Skills in Motion: boys' motor biking activities as transitions into working class masculinity' *Sport, Education and Society*. iFirst DOI:10.1080/13573322.2012.692669
- Ivinson, G. and Renold, E. (2013a) Valleys' Girls: Re-theorising Bodies and Agency in a Semi-Rural, Post-industrial Locale, *Gender and Education*, 25 (6) (Special issue: Feminist Materialisms and Education) pp. 704-721
- Ivinson, G. and Renold, E. (2013b) Subjectivity, affect and place: Thinking with Deleuze and Guattari's Body without Organs to explore a young teen girl's becomings in a post-industrial locale, *Subjectivity* 6 (4): 369-390;
- Negri, A. and Hardt, M. (2000) *Empire*. Cambridge, Massachusetts & London, England: Harvard University Press.
- Hilton, L. (2013) The horse in my flesh: transpecies performance and affective athleticism, *GLQ: Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies*, 19 (4): 487-514

- Hughes, C. and Lury, C. (2013) Re-turning feminist methodologies: from a social to an ecological epistemology, *Gender and Education* 25 (6): 786-799
- Juelskjaer, M. (2013) Gendered subjectivities of spacetime, *Gender and Education*, 25 (6): 754-768
- Lury, C. and Wakeford, N. (2012) *Inventive Methods: The Happening of the Social*. London: Routledge.
- Parisi, L. (2009) "The Adventures of Sex", In C. Nigiani and M. Storr (eds), *Deleuze and Queer Theory*, Edinburgh University Press, 2009, 72-92.
- Probyn, E. (1993) Girls and Girls and Girls and Horses: Queer Images of Singularity and Desire, *Tessera*, Winter Vol 15: 22-29
- Probyn, E. (1996) *Outside Belongings*. London: Routledge.
- Ojanen, K. (2012) You Became Someone' Social Hierarchies in Girls' Communities at Riding Stables. *Young: Nordic Journal of Youth Research*, 20 (2): 137-156
- Quinn, J. (2013) Theorising learning and nature, post-human possibilities and problems, *Gender and Education*, 25 (6): 738-753
- Renold, E. (2013) *Boys and girls speak out: a qualitative study of children's gender and sexual cultures* (age 10-12). Cardiff: Cardiff University.
- Renold, E. and Ringrose, J. (2011) Schizoid Subjectivities: Re-theorising teen-girls' sexual cultures in an era of sexualisation, *Journal of Sociology* 47 (4): 389-409
- Renold, E. and Ivinson, G. (2013) "Girls, Camera, (intra)Action: applying a diffractive analysis to teen girls' engagement with visual participatory methodologies in ethnographic research on gender, subjectivity and place", paper presented at *American Education Research Association* conference, San Francisco, April 27-May 1.
- Ringrose, J. (2007) Successful girls?: Complicating post-feminist, neo-liberal discourses of educational achievement and gender equality, *Gender and Education*, 19 (4): 471- 489.
- Ringrose, J. (2013) *Postfeminist education: Girls and the sexual politics of schooling*. London: Routledge.
- Taylor, C. and Ivinson, G. (2013) Material feminisms: new directions for education, *Gender and Education*, 25 (6): 665-670

- Thompson, C. (2008) *Harnessed: Colliery horses in Wales*. National Museum Wales.
- Walkerdine, V. (2010) Communal Beingness and Affect: An Exploration of Trauma in an Ex Industrial Community. *Body & Society*, 16 (1):91-116.
- Walkerdine, V. and Jimenez, J. (2012) *Gender, work and community after de-industrialization: a psychosocial approach to affect*, Basingstoke, PalgraveMacmillan.
- Walkerdine, V. (2013^{first}) Using the Work of Felix Guattari to Understand Space, Place, Social Justice, and Education, *Qualitative Inquiry*, DOI: 10.1177/1077800413502934
- Weidemeyer, S. (2006) Women and Horses in Contemporary Art, Unpublished MSc Thesis.
<http://www.susanwdavidson.com/wpcontent/uploads/2012/12/Final-Paper-Version-2.pdf>
- Young, M. I. (2005) *On Female Body Experience: 'Throwing Like a Girl' and Other Essays*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

ⁱ Note 1 This publication is based on research supported by the Wales Institute of Social and Economic Research, Data and Methods (WISERD) funded by the UK Economic and Social Research Council (Grant number: RES-576-25-0021) and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. The full research team included: Gabrielle Ivinson, Emma Renold, Kate Moles and Mariann Martsin.